

## **PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD**

**MONDAY, AUGUST 23, 2004**

**3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II**

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members Kirk, Kreider, Raser, Senhauser, Spraul-Schmidt, Sullebarger and Wallace present. Absent: Bloomfield and Chatterjee

### **MINUTES**

The minutes of the Monday, August 9, 2004 meeting were unanimously approved as submitted (Motion by Spraul-Schmidt, second by Wallace).

### **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 516 TUSCULUM AVE, COLUMBIA TUSCULUM HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented the staff report regarding the property at 516 Tusculum Avenue, which is in the Tusculum Historic District. The main facade of the building has been drastically altered before the designation of the historic district and since the district was created, it has slowly been brought back to what it was originally.

Mr. Patrick Haughton, owner and Mr. Larry Adams, contractor are both present and seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct an addition on top of a porch built with permission from the Historic Conservation Board in December 1994. The design, based on the adjacent property to the south at 514 Tusculum Avenue, will include a bathroom on the second story and a deck on the third story accessed through a new gable dormer.

Ms. Cowden stated that the deck and dormer are two aspects of the design that are problematic. The guidelines specifically prohibit decks on the front or street facades of buildings as well as rooftop decks unless they are cut into the roof structure or will not result in a change in the roofline or the loss of architectural details. Staff's opinion is that cutting the deck in the roofline of the building would result in more damage to the historic property than what is merited for this feature.

The diagonal dormer is unusual in form and location, but a reasonable solution to providing access to the deck on the third story. Because of the sharply sloping topography of the site, the new dormer will not be highly visible from the public right-of-way along Tusculum Avenue. Staff would like to see this feature in a less visible location, but believes specific conditions of the site and this residence render the proposal acceptable.

Mr. Haughton responded to Mr. Raser that the material on the front elevation is predominately painted wood; all trim will be wood.

Ms. Sullebarger expressed concerns about the large center window and felt it should be divided. She said the diagonal dormer changes the roofline, does not meet the guidelines and will set a precedent. Mr. Kreider stated that every house has its own design and should be addressed individually.

Ms. Sullebarger offered an amendment to the staff recommendation requiring the central window to be divided. The motion was defeated.

**BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Raser, second Spraul-Schmidt) to take the following actions:

Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed addition with the condition that final construction drawings and material selections be submitted to the Urban Conservator for approval prior to construction.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AND ZONING VARIANCES FOR  
1317 VINE STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member, Ms. Caroline Kellam presented the staff report on a proposal by the Art Academy of Cincinnati to build an archway as an entry gateway into the park at 1317 Vine Street. The arch will be covered on all sides with mosaic plaques designed by Over-The-Rhine residents.

The property is located in a CC-P Commercial Community Pedestrian Zoning District and zoning variances are required to construct the arch that exceeds 10' in width and 10' in height. Staff recommends the construction and zoning variances for the arch.

Ms. Michele Markert, Art Academy of Cincinnati representative and Brian Lacon, Architect, Miller Valentine Group was present to address questions from the Board.

In response to Mr. Raser and Mr. Kirk, Ms. Kellam stated there are no company or product names on the arch. She said she had no photos or drawings showing the arch in context with adjacent buildings.

Mr. Brian Lacon responded to Mr. Senhauser that the chain link fence shown in the photos was placed there by another company; the Art Academy will remove the fence when the foundation has been completed on their project.

**BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Wallace, second by Kreider, Sullebarger abstained), to take the following actions:

1. Grant a zoning variance for the arch as proposed at 1317 Vine Street as per Chapter 1421-33 Fences and Walls of the Cincinnati Zoning Code finding that such relief from the literal implication of the Zoning Code will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety, and welfare or injurious to property in the district or vicinity where the property is located and either:
  - a) Is necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation so as not to adversely affect the historic architectural or aesthetic integrity of the district; or
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the arch with the mosaic artwork at 1317 Vine Street.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, AND ZONING VARIANCES, 1115  
BROADWAY, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Caroline Kellam presented the staff report regarding the property at 1115 Broadway located in the Over-The-Rhine Historic District. On May 10, 2004, the Board approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new surface parking lot with the condition that a landscape and fencing plan be submitted at a later date.

Mark Gunther, architect and Bill Baum applicant have complied with the conditions of the Board and have returned for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a gate and fence. Ms. Kellam said the structure would be 12' high, 21' wide and continues the line of the storefront cornice of 1113 Broadway. A 4' high fence will be built atop a stone wall at the rear of the property along Bunker Alley.

Staff stated the property is in a (CC-P) Commercial Community Pedestrian Zoning District and needs variances for the width and height of the gateway. The 12' high gate exceeds the maximum height and width allowable per Chapter 1421-33c. Staff recommends a 10' high fence for which no variance for the height would be required.

Mr. Kirk suggested that the head of the vehicle door (bottom of the box) align with the existing door and transom in the adjacent building at 1113 Broadway.

Mr. Raser and Ms. Sullebarger agreed that the 12' fence is acceptable in this case because it reads as an infill structure, rather than a simple fence.

### **BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion Kirk, second by Kreider with amendment) to take the following actions:

1. Grant a zoning variance for a 21' wide gateway that will exceed 10' high for 1115 Broadway as per Chapter 1421-33 Fences and Walls of the Cincinnati Zoning Code finding that such relief from the literal implication of the Zoning Code will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety, and welfare or injurious to property in the district or vicinity where the property is located and either:
  - a) Is necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation so as not to adversely affect the historic architectural or aesthetic integrity of the district; or
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the four-foot high fence along Bunker Alley and a 21' wide gateway at 1115 Broadway with the bottom of the cap box to align with the top of the transom on 1113 Broadway.

### **OTHER BUSINESS**

Ms. Kellam showed photographs and a manufacture's brochure of a handicap ramp proposed for 430 Reading Road. The HCB had previously approved a ramp, but this ramp (designed as a temporary structure) is different from the ramp that was previously approved. The Board agreed that it need not rehear this proposal or other similar temporary structures.

### **BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion Sullebarger, second Raser) to authorize the Urban Conservator to review and approve temporary ramps that meet the guidelines for the applicable district.

**ADJOURNMENT**

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned.

---

William L. Forwood  
Urban Conservator

---

John C. Senhauser, Chairman

Date: \_\_\_\_\_